

Sharpening Frege's Argument against the Metalinguistic solution

1. The morning star = the evening star.
2. 'The morning star' and 'the evening star' denote the same object.

(2) is not the correct analysis of (1). Someone might well know the fact reported by (1) but be ignorant of the fact reported by (2).

Translate (1) and (2) into German:

3. Der Morgenstern = der Abendstern.
4. 'Der Morgenstern' und 'der Abendstern' bedeuten den gleichen Gegenstand.

(4) is not the correct translation of (2) into German—to suppose so is to commit a use-mention confusion. The correct translation is this:

5. 'The morning star' und 'the evening star' bedeuten den gleichen Gegenstand.

So we need to compare (3) and (5). And they are clearly not equivalent. Otto may know what (3) expresses, but not know what (5) expresses.

So (1) and (2) are not equivalent, either.